DELEGATED REPORT / CASE OFFICER'S ASSESSMENT

Ref No: ST/0597/23/HFUL
Proposal: Retention of detached garage
Location: 29 Whitburn Road
Cleadon
SR6 7QP

Site Visit Made: 26/10/2023

Relevant policies/SPDs

1 DM1 - Management of Development (A, B & G)

2 DM6 - Heritage Assets and Archaeology

3 SPD9 - Householder Developments

4 SPD14 - Cleadon Conservation Area Management Plan - Adopted April 2009

Description of the site and of the proposals

The application site consists of a detached bungalow on Whitburn Road, Cleadon, finished in white render with a grey tiled roof. The site is accessed via a shared access to the west of no. 27 Whitburn Road, which also provides access to no. 31 Whitburn Road. The dwelling forms an 'L' shape, with a detached garage (subject to this application) sited to the north of the dwelling. The dwelling lies within a residential area, with the immediate neighbours to the west and north. (nos. 23, 25, 27 and 31 Whitburn Road). The site lies within the Cleadon Conservation Area.

Planning permission is sought for the retention of a detached garage at the above address. The garage measures 9.8 metres by 6.4 metres, 2.4 metres to the eaves and 4.6 metres to the ridge. The garage contains 2 no. garage doors to the western elevation, and is sited to the north of the dwelling. The garage will be rendered to match the dwelling on the site. There was an existing detached garage on the site but it has been demolished to make way for the proposal. At the time of the officers site visit the garage was substantially complete.

Publicity / Consultations **(Expiry date neighbour letters 26.10.2023, site notice 31.20.2023, press advert 08.11.2023)**

Neighbour responses

23 Whitburn Road, Cleadon- I believe the large, detached, pitched roof garage that has been built directly on the other side of my Dad's rear boundary does detrimentally impact his property for the following reasons:

My Dad's outlook has been negatively impacted by the design and position of the new garage. The view from my Dad's kitchen window is now of a large, pitched roofed garage wall which is not aethetically pleasing;

- The new garage casts a shadow over my Dad's garden so diminishing the garden's enjoyment;
- I worry this may well impact the value of my Dad's house;
- I assume the new garage is 2 metres from my Dad's boundary and this has been measured and confirmed? I believe there was space to leave a larger gap so it didn't feel so overbearing. I see

the applicants have moved the original garage further away from their own property and closer to my Dad's which I believe shows a lack of thought for my Dad/any neighbours;
- The planning application states that the garage wall facing my Dad's property will be rendered and painted to match the existing house but if this is unenforceable, this may not happen and it will remain unsightly; and
- If everyone is allowed to build large structures on their land, I believe the whole area's appearance and character will be diminished.

Other Consultee responses
None

Assessment

Having regard to the requirements of Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004, the relevant Development Plan policies and all other material planning considerations, including representations received, it is considered that the main issues for consideration are the impact upon on visual amenity; the impact on residential amenity, and highway safety and off road parking.

Visual Amenity

The proposed development site is within the Cleadon Conservation Area; therefore regard must be given to Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to assess the impact on the character, appearance and significance of the designated heritage asset.

There is a Conservation Area Management Plan for Cleadon (SPD 14). The site is located within character area 3 (Cleadon Plantation) which is described as a landscaped 'Garden Suburb' estate during its formative years at the turn of the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries. Its character is dominated by a collection of fine Victorian and Edwardian detached houses set in large gardens that came together into what would have been perceived as a large landscaped estate. The extensive use of large gables, slate, decorative timber details, tall chimney stacks and warm red bricks provides a comfortable yet robust appearance to the area. The streets are predominantly tree lined with hedges and mature gardens that occasionally make them look like country lanes. Surviving features, such as working gas lights, enrich the remarkable character of the Plantation.

Later inter and post war phases of development tended to introduce a greater density of housing and, although generally of good quality with attractive examples of period styles, this has diminished the original layout approach established in the early Twentieth Century. Some recent designs are, however, of limited quality and there is increasing pressure to sub-divide the larger gardens into smaller building plots. This has resulted in a loss of landscape, an imbalance in the historic spatial relationship between built development and ancillary garden space, reduced the quality of the setting of the houses, compromised the design approach that underpins the philosophy of the 'Garden Suburb' movement and introduced openings into hedge lines.

NPPF parts 12 and 16 advocate the importance of achieving good design in new developments, which show sensitivity to heritage assets and the historic environment.

Policy DM1(A) requires extensions and alterations to an existing dwellinghouse to convey sensitive consideration to its surroundings; and where possible enhance its local setting and reinforce local identity, having particular regard to scale and proportions, alignment, form, use of materials and architectural detailing.

Policy DM6 supports development that makes a positive contribution towards the conservation and enhancement of the historic environment.

SPD9 (House Holder Developments) of the South Tyneside LDF provides guidance in respect of householder developments.

SPD 14 sets out principles for development which states that the Council will only permit development in, or affecting the setting of, Cleadon Conservation Area that protects, preserves and where possible enhances its character or appearance.

Paragraph 15.3 of SPD9 states that detached garages should be subordinate to and reflect the character of the existing dwelling. Poorly designed detached garages can be overly dominant and be detrimental to the character of the area. The following matters should also be considered:

- the garage should be located to minimise impact on the street scene. Where possible, detached garages should be located to the side of the dwelling and set back from the front wall of the existing dwelling;
- the garage should be sited so as to retain a minimum driveway length of 5.5 metres between the garage door and the boundary edge of the adopted highway or shared service road verge, or 5.0 metres where a roller shutter garage door is used.

The garage is not visible from public viewpoints given the sites back land location. The garage features materials that would match the existing property (which was a concern raised by the neighbour) and is located to the side of the dwelling, and is set back approximately 1.8 metres from the front of the dwelling. The host dwelling has a generous curtilage, it is considered that the garage would not be detrimental to the street scene, nor be to the detriment of the character of appearance of the wider conservation area as the tree lined street, identified as one of the main characteristics of the Plantation Character Area, would remain unchanged by the proposal.

The neighbour has queried the position of the garage. Following the officer site visit, the garage has been erected in the position shown on the proposed plans.

Given the above and having regards to S72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, it is considered that the design and scale of the proposed extension to the building would not harm the visual amenities of the site's immediate environs or the character, appearance and historic significance of the Cleadon Conservation Area. The design, scale and nature of the proposals are considered to sufficiently convey sensitive consideration of its surroundings and protect the special character of the Cleadon Conservation Area, in accordance with LDF policies DM1 (A) and DM6 of the South Tyneside LDF, and having regard to guidance in SPD9 and SPD14.

Residential Amenity

Parts 12 and 15 of the NPPF, require that a good standard of amenity for existing and future users be ensured. In line with this, Policy DM1(B) of the South Tyneside LDF seeks to protect residential amenity of neighbours from harmful impacts from development.

Comments have been received on behalf of the occupier of 23 Whitburn Road which is the neighbouring property to the north.

Comment has been made that the garage is visible from the rear kitchen window of no. 23. The garage is sited approximately 13 metres from the rear elevation of no. 23. There is an approximately 2 metre high hedge on the shared boundary with the application site and no. 23. As such the upper portion of the garage is visible. It is acknowledged that the garage is visible from no. 23 but given the 13 metre separation distance between the rear of no. 23 and the garage, this is considered to be sufficient to not result in any overbearing impacts to no. 23 Whitburn Road.

Comment has also been made that the garage casts a shadow onto the garden on no. 23 Whitburn Road. In terms of overshadowing impacts, given the orientation of the properties, as the adjoining objectors dwelling lies to the north of the application site, and as the sun rises in the east and moves westwards during the day, by mid-day in the winter the garage will cast a shadow over part of no. 23's rear garden. However, by mid afternoon this overshadowing would not occur as the sun moves around west. The garage would increase overshadowing to the rear garden of no. 23, however it is considered that this would not be to such a significant further level or sustained period to have an adverse or harmful impact on the attached neighbour. SPD9 states that the overshadowing of outdoor spaces is given less weight than impact within the dwelling. Where the affected space is part of a small plot land/or the overshadowing removes the only area of sunlight a space receives, this may be given increased weight. A large proportion of the rear garden of no. 23 would be unaffected by overshadowing from the proposed development given its approx. 20.3 metre width and substantial depth of approx. 10 metres. It is therefore considered on balance, the occupiers of no. 23 Whitburn Road would not be significantly adversely impacted in terms of loss of privacy, outlook, overdominance or overshadowing.

Sufficient useable amenity space would be retained to the host dwelling.

Overall, it is not considered that the proposal has any potential to materially harm the residential amenity of any neighbouring occupier. Therefore, the proposed development is considered to be in accordance with Policy DM1 (B), while having regard to the principles set out in SPD 9.

Highway Safety and Off-Road Parking

The proposed development will not impact the existing driveway length to the front of the host property ensuring vehicles can continue to be parked without affecting the public footpath. Therefore, the proposal would be acceptable in terms of highways safety and would be in accordance with LDF Policy DM1 (G).

Other matters

Comment has been made that the garage will affect the value of neighbouring dwellings. Matters relating to house values are not a material planning consideration.

Conclusion

It is considered that in the site circumstances and context of this particular case that the proposal would be in accordance with Local Development Framework (LDF) Policy DM1 (A, B, and G), and the design guidance in Supplementary Planning Document (SPD) 9 'Householder Developments'. The proposal would also be in accordance with guidance in SPD14 'Cleadon Conservation Area Management Plan'. Having regard to all other material planning consideration, it is considered that the proposal would be an acceptable form of development, subject to the conditions listed below.

In assessing this application due regard has been had to the requirement of section 149 of the Equality Act 2010.

Recommendation

Grant Permission Householder with Conditions

Conditions

1 The external surfaces of the development hereby permitted shall be as specified on the submitted planning application forms received 09/08/2023.

To ensure a satisfactory standard of development and in the interests of visual amenity in accordance with South Tyneside LDF Development Management Policy DM1.

Informatives

1 The proposed development lies within a coal mining area which may contain unrecorded coal mining related hazards. If any coal mining feature is encountered during development, this should be reported immediately to the Coal Authority on 0345 762 6848.

Further information is also available on the Coal Authority website at: www.gov.uk/government/organisations/the-coal-authority

List of plans for standard note

Plan Reference

Existing and Proposed Site Layout Plans Drg. No. 001 received 18/09/2023

Proposed Garage Plans Drg. No. 007 received 09/08/2023

Case officer: Adam Williamson
Date: 10th November 2023

Authorised Signatory:
Date:

«END»